

Case No.:

UNITED NATIONS DISPUTE TRIBUNAL

1. The applicant filed on 2 December (2014) a memo and on 2+ January (2015) a letter to the Director of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) contesting the non-selection to four posts advertised in the 2014 and 7 August, 2014 Compendium of Vacant Positions name list.

a. Chief of Section (Promotion of Employees) in the Administration / General Services Division (UNEP) Job 9 "en" 12J934 &+24 1: ; "e" Position No. 1001<7544 12Position 134-

b. Chief of Section (Promotion of Employees) in the Administration / General Services Division (UNEP) Job 9 "en" 12J934 &+24 1: ; "e" Position No. 100142<54 12Position 234-

c. Chief of Section (Promotion of Employees) in the Administration / General Services Division (UNEP) Job 9 "en" 12J934 &+24 1: ; "e" Position No. 10020<&24 12Position +34- and

d. Chief of Section (Promotion of Employees) in the Administration / General Services Division (UNEP) Job 9 "en" 12J934 &+24 1: ; "e" Position No. 1001<0154 12Position 434.

2. The applicant based UNHCR Job 9 "en" 12J934 &+24 1: ; "e" Position No. 100142<54 12Position 234- on the 2000 as a promotion of employees (at the P5+ level) in the Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) and Casagrande (appointed as a consultant under the 100 series of the former staff rules). In January (2004) s, e Casagrande intended to the "position of the applicant" 9 ff%e(1P5+4 at the Contracted UN Staff Management (Employees) in Geneva and in December (2007) s, e Casagrande as a consultant (Contracted 9 ff%e(1P544 Contract, in the same unit. In November (200& s, e Casagrande (promoted to the P54 level).

3. In August 2012 the applicant's position as a consultant (Contracted 9 ff%e(Casagrande) was terminated and from that time s, e Casagrande (appointed as a consultant) assignments in Geneva. 7 October s"e" f%a##! s, e August 2012 s, e Casagrande (appointed as a consultant).

assigned as 6en\$(Cont(a%ts 9ff\$(to t,e 0eg\$ona# u(eau fo(As\$a and t,e Pa%f\$% and* \$n 7 a(% , 2014* s,e Cas tem"o(a(\$#! assigned as 6en\$(Dega# 9ff\$(to t,e 6taff Coun%\$. 6n%e 1 Janua(! 2015* s,e ,as 'een tem"o(a(\$#! assigned as 6en\$(Po#\$! 9ff\$(C\$t, t,e D\$)ss\$on of /uman 0esou(%es 7anagement 12D / 0 7 34.

4. Pos\$t\$on 1 Cas ad)e(t\$sed as an 2e;"e(t "os\$t\$on3 \$nte(na##! on 15 A"(\$# 2014 \$n t,e 7 a(% , 2014 Com"end\$um of Va%ant Pos\$t\$ons u" to De'em'e(2014 12 7 a(% , 2014 Com"end\$um34* as Ce## as e;te(na##!. ?t (eEu\$(ed* so#\$d e; "e(\$en%e \$n %oo(d\$nat\$ng* manag\$ng and su""o(t\$ng "(o%u(ement se())\$es* as Ce## as \$n de)e#o"\$ng te%,n\$a# s"\$e\$f\$%at\$ons fo("(o%u(ement se())\$es and \$n de)e#o"\$ng te%,n\$a##! and #ega##! %om"#e; se())\$e %ont(a%ts.

5. Afte(,a)\$ng (e%e\$)ed ,e(a""#\$%at\$on* D / 0 7 "#a%ed t,e A""#\$%ant on t,e s ,o(t5#\$st of %and\$dates su'm\$tted to t,e manage(-s (e)\$eC* 'ut t,e #atte(found ,e(not su\$ta'#e fo(t,e "os\$t\$on* on t,e g(ound t,at 2Fs,e ,adG "(esented fo(a s\$m\$a("ost as C ,sef of 6e%t\$on 1P(o%u(ement of Goods4 and d\$d not \$m"(ess t,e "ane# \$n \$nte())eC3 and 2Cas %onseEuent#! not s,o(t#\$sted fo(fu(t,e(%ons\$de(at\$on3.

6. ased on t,e manage(-s assessment* D / 0 7 d\$d not (e%ommend t,e A""#\$%ant fo(Pos\$t\$on 1 as s,e d\$d not 2"ossess t,e (eEu\$(ed 'a%Ag(ound o((e#e)ant e;"e(\$en%e fo(t,\$s "os\$t\$on3* and (e%ommended anot,e(\$nte(na# %and\$date at t,e P54 #e)e# fo(se#e%t\$on.

7.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/075

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/067

17. D / 0 7 " #a%ed t,e A""#S%ant* C,o ,ad a#so a""#Sed to t,\$s "os#t\$on* on t,e s,o(t5#st of %and\$dates and soug,t 2fun%t\$ona# %#ea(an%e3 f(om t,e D\$)\$s\$on of ?nte(nat\$ona# P(ote%t\$on.

1<.

Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2015/075

+7. ot, "a(tses ag(eed t, at t, e "(esent %ase 'e de%\$ded on t, e "a"e(s.

+<. T, e A""#\$%ant-s "((\$n%\$"a# %ontent\$ons a(e8

a. 6, e Cas not %onsu#ted '! D / 0 7 to ensu(e t, at s, e , ad a%%ess to a##

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/075

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/067

§.

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/075

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/067

e. The Applicant's status as a staff member in recent assignments did not (EU) (a) (u) (ons) (at) on as t, e 6? A Po#! does not a"#! to (egu) (assignments unde t, e PPAP* and t, e #atte(does not "(o) (de fo("(o) (t! (ons) (de) (at) (on fo(staff mem' e(s C, o a(e n 'etCeen assignments=

f. D(A) (C) (se) t, e A"#! (ant) (d) (d) not su' m(t an! e) (den) (e

s, a# e; am\$ne 2114 C, et, e(t, e "(o%edu(e as #a\$d doCn \$n t, e 6taff 0egu#at\$ons
and 0u#es Cas fo##oCed= and 124 C, et, e(t, e staff mem'e(Cas g\$)en fa\$(and
adeEuete %ons\$de(at\$on3 1/""

Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2015/075

Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2015/075

67. Considering that, in the lead of the Procurement Management and Contracting
6e() %e (e#sed e; %us\$) e#! on \$((e#e)ant %onsde(at\$ons to Bust\$! ,s f\$nd\$ng t, at

2st(ong "(ote%t\$on 'a%Ag(ound3. As t,e A""#%ant-s fa%t s,eet s,oCs* s,e Co(Aed on#! fo(t,(ee !ea(s \$n t,e a(ea of "(ote%t\$on* \$.e. f(om 2000 to 200+= \$t Cas* t,e(fo(e* not un(easona'#e to %on%#ude t,at s,e d\$d not ,a)e t,e (eEu\$(ed e;"e(\$en%e fo(t,e "ost.

7+. G\$)en t,at t,e A""#%ant Cas found not su\$ta'#e fo(t,e "ost and* t,e(fo(e* Cas not among t,e 2su'stant\$a##! eEua##! su\$ta'#e %and\$dates3* t,e(e Cas no (eEu\$(ement to taAe \$nto a%%ount ,e(s\$tuat\$on as a staff \$n 'etCeen ass\$gnments o(on tem"o(a(! ass\$gnment \$n t,e se#e%t\$on of t,e %and\$date fo(Pos\$t\$on 2.

74. Dast#!* t,e T(\$'una# f\$nds t,at t,e m\$nutes of t,e mat%,\$ng e;e(%\$se* as (ef#e%ted \$n t,e D / 0 7 6,o(t#\$st\$ng 7 at(\$;* %om"#! C\$t, t,e (eEu\$(ement of

'ased on t,e A""#s%ant-s fa%t s,eet* t,at s,e d\$d not "ossess t,e (eEu\$(ed
e;"e(\$en%. T,e assessment of t,e .un%t\$ona# Un\$t Cas* \$n tu(n* a (e#e)ant e#ement

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/075

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/067

(

<5. 6\$ne t,e %ontested de%%s\$on %on%(ns a "(omot\$on/a""o\$ntment* t,e T(\$'una# s,a## set an amount of %om"ensat\$on t,at t,e Oes"ondent ma! e#e%t to "a! as an a#te(nat\$)e to t,e (es%%s\$on of t,e %ontested de%%s\$on* \$n a%%o(dan%e C\$t, a(t. 10.5la4 of \$ts 6tatute.

<6.

omitted. Although, the settlement of Position 1 could have had no impact on the "Economic Goods, the Cou#d, a) e'een (emune(ated at t, e P55 #e)e#.

<&. The SEC of the 'o) e5(efe(en%ed "(N%"#es* and g\$)en t, at t, e A""#%ant Cas st\$## (emune(ated at t, e P54 #e)e# at t, e t\$me of \$ssu\$ng t, e "(esent de%\$s\$on and t, at t, e T('\$'una# does not, a) e an! %on%(ete \$nd\$%at\$on as to C, en t, e A""#%ant C\$## 'e a'#e* \$n t, e futu(e* to seeA ass\$gnment to a "ost at t, e P55 #e)e# \$t %ons\$de(s t, at \$t \$s a""(o"(\$ate to assess %om"ensat\$on* unde(a(t. 10.51a4 of \$ts 6tature* ' ! ta\$ng \$nto a%ount t, e est\$imated (emune(at\$on d\$ffe(en%e 'etCeen t, e P54 and t, e P55 g(ade fo(a "e(\$od of tCo !ea(s* C, \$%, t, en, as to 'e d\$)d\$ed ' ! tCo. based on t, ese fa%to(s* t, e amount of %om"ensat\$on t, at t, e 0es"ondent ma! e#e#t to "a! \$nstead of (es\$nd\$ng t, e de%\$s\$on \$s set to U6D+*500.

Com"ensat\$on

&0. The A""#%ant asAs fo(%om"ensat\$on eEu\$a#ent to u" to s\$; mont, s net sa#a(! fo(2"(o%edu(a# \$(egua(\$t\$es and me(\$ts3* nota'#! fo(fa\$#ng to taAe a 2"(o"e(ass\$gnment de%\$s\$on3. 6, e a#so %a#ms %om"ensat\$on fo(mo(a# damages fo(* * 2"(eBud\$%a# o"\$n\$on of manage(s3.

&1. The T('\$'una# ma!* "u(suant to a(t. 10.51'4 of \$ts 6tature* aCa(d %om"ensat\$on fo(,a(m suffe(ed as a (esu#t of a %ontested de%\$s\$on* \$f su%, ,a(m ,as not 'een %om"ensated ' ! t, e (es%\$s\$on. .o(su%, %om"ensat\$on to 'e aCa(ded* t, e A""#%ant must \$dent\$f! t, e ,a(m suffe(ed. The T('\$'una# notes t, at a(t. 10.51'4 of \$ts 6tature a""u4 7 434 7 (,)834245(a(138. 7(5(9434 7(o)-0. 960221(n)9. 6984. 74-7 (

&+. Tu(n\$ng to mo(a# damages* t,e T(\$'una# %ons\$de(s t,

: nte(ed \$n t, e Oeg\$S