Case No. UNDT/NBI/2023/017

Order No.: 87 (NBI/2024)

## Introduction

1. The pplicant was the Chief Procurement Officer with the frican Union/United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur ("UN MID"). He held a continuing appointment at the P-5 level and was based in El-Fasher, Sudan. He contests the Respondent's decision to deny his claim for ppendix D benefits.

## **Procedural History and consideration**

- 2. On 22 February 2023, the pplicant filed a motion for extension of time to file an application before the United Nations Dispute Tribunal in respect of the decision by the United Nations dvisory Board on Compensation Claims ("BCC"), dated 15 ugust 2022, to deny his claim for illness and injuries to his right knee.
- 3. By Order No. 54 (NBI/2023) dated 24 February 2023, the Tribunal granted the pplicant's motion.
- 4. On 24 pril 2023, the pplicant filed his application challenging the decision of the Controller to endorse the recommendation of the BCC to deny his claim for compensation.
- 5. The Respondent filed his reply to the application on 12 June 2023. The Respondent moved the Court to dismiss the application on ground that the pplicant failed to provide the evidence necessary to support his claim.
- 6. The Tribunal held a case management discussion ("CMD") on 20 December 2023 to discuss the issues and further evidence necessary for proper adjudication of this case.

Case No. UNDT/NBI/2023/017 Order No.: 87 (NBI/2024)

7. On 21 December 2023, the Tribunal issued Order No. 176 (NBI/2023) directing the parties to provide the Court with "all medical documents in his custody, care, or control that relate to treatments undertaken and/or his physical condition from 1996 to present" by 1 March 2024. The parties were also strongly encouraged to consider engaging in settlement discussions to resolve this matter

8. On 30 January 2024, the Registry wrote to the parties. On the direction of the Presiding Judge, the Registry wrote (emphasis in original):

The Tribunal **strongly** encourages the parties to deploy the necessary effort towards having this matter resolved or with the assistance of the United Nations Office of the Ombudsman and Mediation Services (UNOMS).

The gathering of documents for submission to the Tribunal by 1 March 2024 should proceed apace, while alternative dispute resolution is being explored.

9. On 13 February 2024, the pplicant filed submissions indicating 8877 cw

Case No. UNDT/NBI/2023/017

Order No.: 87 (NBI/2024)

13. s the Respondent was unable to provide the Tribunal with a timeline for the next sitting of the BCC and the pplicant is concerned about further delays, the Presiding Judge directed Counsel for the Respondent to ensure that a decision on the BCC review be issued by Wednesday, 15 May 2024.

- 14. Both parties submitted the most recent decision of the BCC to the Tribunal on 15 May 2024.
- 15. Specifically, the pplicant submitted that:

The current decision of the BCC, was taken solely on the advice of the DMSHO. The DMSHO and specifically the Medical Director being clearly and irremediably conflicted, being at the same time medical advisers to the BCC and the UNJSPF, responsible for medical clearance for staff members, settling medical standard for field missions, and directing and supervising the implementation of medical services.

- 16. The pplicant moved the Tribunal to lift the suspension of these proceedings and proceed to trial.
- 17. The Tribunal held a CMD with the parties on 11 June 2024.
- 18. The Respondent took the position that the most recent review by the BCC, and the Controller's decision following that review, raises receivability issues that must first be determined before the matter could proceed to trial. The pplicant vehemently disagreed with the position espoused by the Respondent.
- 19. The Tribunal directed the parties to file their respective submissions on receivability by 21 June 2024.
- 20. On 20 June 2024, the Respondent moved the Tribunal to postpone that deadline by 7 days; and undertook to file his receivability submissions by 28 June 2024.

Case No. UNDT/NBI/2023/017

Order No.: 87 (NBI/2024)

21. On 28 June 2024, the pplicant filed submissions entitled "On Medical Determinations by the Medical Director". The pplicant requests the Tribunal to direct

the Respondent to provide:

a. The medical reports and recommendations of the medical

directors to the Board of the Joint Staff Pension Fund that granted the pplicant a section 33 Disability benefit under the rules and regulations

of the UNJSPF;

b. If the medical reports and recommendations of the medical

director to the BCC dealing with the pplicant.

22. The Tribunal notes that the Respondent has, to-date, not filed the receivability

submissions he undertook to file by 28 June 2024.

Conclusion

23. In view of the foregoing it is ORDERED TH T:

a. The Tribunal hereby grants the pplicant's 28 June 2024 request and

directs the Respondent to provide the pplicant and the Tribunal, by Monday,

19 August 2024, the reports referred to in para. 21 above; and

b. Both parties shall make their respective receivability submissions available

to the Tribunal also by Monday, 19 August 2024.

Judge Sean Wallace

Dated this 16th day of July 2024

Entered in the Register on this 16th day of July 2024

René M. Vargas M., Officer-in-Charge, Nairobi