UNITED NATIONS D

Introduction

1. O% 1 !"%e 2017(&.e A99-,:a%&(a Se%,o+ Coo+#,%a&,o

&.e 9oss,*,-,&@ of ?o,%#e+6 ,f a% a99-,:a&,o% aga,%s& &.e %o%1+e%e8a- 8e+e &o *e f,-e#6 a& a%o&.e+ :ase $a%age$e%& #,s:"ss,o% &o *e .e-# o% 30 O:&o*e+ 201'.

13. O% 2 a%# 12 O:&o*e+ 201'6 &.e 9a+&,es s"*$,&&e# a##,&,o%a- #o:"$e%&s6 as 9e+ O+#e+ No. 1 A.

1A. O% 30 O:&o*e+ 201'6 &.e T+,*"%a- .e-# a se:o%# :ase $a%age$e%& #,s:"ss,o%6 &o +e),e8 9+og+ess. S,%:e &.e A99-,:a%&7s +eE"es& fo+ $a%age$e%& e)a-"a&,o% of &.e #e:,s,o% %o& &o +e%e8 .,s a99o,%&$e%& 8as s&,-- "%#e+ :o%s,#e+a&,o%6 *@ O+#e+ No. 1'1 ;GVA/201'< of 31 O:&o*e+ 201'6 &.e T+,*"%a- #efe++e# :o%s,#e+a&,o% of a 9oss,*-e ?o,%#e+ &o a f"+&.e+ :ase $a%age$e%& #,s:"ss,o%.

1 . O% H No)e$*e+ 201'6 &.e A99-,:a%& f,-e# a##,&,o%a- s"*$,ss,o%s a%# #o:"$e%&s ,% +es9o%se &o #o:"$e%&s s"*$,&&e# o% 2 a%# 12 O:&o*e+ 201'6 as #,+e:&e# *@ O+#e+ No. 1'1. O% 1(No)e$*e+ 201'6 &.e Res9o%#e%& +es9o%#e# &o &.e A99-,:a%&7s a##,&,o%a- s"*$,ss,o%s.

1(. O% 20 No)e$*e+ :$a%age$e%& #,s:"ss,o%6 8.e+e*@ &.e A99-,:a%& %fo+$e# "%a- %# .e .a# f,-e# a% a99-,:a&,o% ga,%s& &.e %o%1+e%e8a- f %s 4TA *efo+e &.e ,s9"&e T+,*"%a- ,% a,+o*,. 5e so"g.& ?o,%#e+ of &0 2 2 1(%)-0+:9%81s6-9(7184 36(a)-13.6%5816(%)9.69844947()83)-2657(9 a%@ f"+&.e+ #e-a@ ,% :o%s,#e+,%g &.,s :ase s.o"-# *e a)o,#e#. I& 8o"-# *e fo+ 66-9.78436(.)9.69849(e)-3

,%a::"+a:,es6&.e +eso-"&,o% of 8.,:. 8o"-#%o&#,s&"+*&.e esse%&,a- fa:&"a- f,%#,%gs a%# +easo%s fo+&.e ,$9"g%e# #e:,s,o%s.

arties# su!$issions

1H. T.e A99-,:a%&7s 9+,%:,9a- :o%&e%&,o%s a+e:

a. T.e &8o eo+a%#a s&+,99e#.,$ of .,s #e-ega&,o% of a"&.o+,&@ a%# $os& of .,s f"%:&,o%s. T.e fa,-"+e &o 9+o),#e a ?"s&,f,:a&,o% fo+ #e9+,),%g .,$ of .,s #"&,es ,%#,:a&e &.a& &.e #e:,s,o%s 8e+e ,$9+o9e+-@ $o&,)a&e# a%# +e&a-,a&o+@I

*. I% 9a+&,:"-a+6&.e +easo% of &.e $a%age$e%& +e),e8 a99ea+s &o *e a:o)e+ fo+ +e&a-,a&,%g aga,%s& .,$ fo+ .,s eB9+esse# #,sag+ee$e%& 8,&. a:&,o%s of se%,o+ $a%age$e%&I

:. T.e &,$,%g of &.e eo+a%#a ,s e),#e%:e &.a& &.e@ 8e+e a,$e# a& 9+e)e%&,%g &.e A99-,:a%& f+o$:o%)e@,%g .,s #,sse%&,%g),e8s &o s&aDe.o-#e+s a%# s&aff e*e+sI

#. T.e $a%age$e%&7s ,$9+o9e+ $o&,)e ,s e),#e%:e# *@ &.e "%-a8f"- a%# ,--eg,&,$a&e +eE"es& &o a::ess &.e A99-,:a%&7s e$a,-s ,% 4e*+"a+@ 2017I

e. T.e A99-,:a%&7s &+a%sfe+ &o a%o&.e+ 9os&,% Na,+o*, o% No)e$*e+ 2017 8,&.o"& a%@ ?o* #es:+,9&,o% o+ &e+ $s of +efe+e%:e a%# &.e s"*seE"e%& a*o-,&,o% of &.e sa,# 9os& #"e &o -,$,&e# f"%#,%g6 a%# &.e %o%1+e%e8a- of .,s a99o,%&$e%&6 a+e f"+&.e+ e),#e%:e of ,$9+o9e+ $o&,)es a%# +e&a-,a&,o%I

f. T.e A99-,:a%& #e%,es .a),%g eB:ee#e# .,s a"&.o+,&@. If .e .a# #o%e so &.,s 8o"-# *e a 9e+fo+$a%:e ,ss"e &.a& 8o"-# %ee# &o *e a##+esse# "%#e+ &.e 9+o9e+ f+a$e8o+D a%# %o& &.+o"g. a #e9+,)a&,o% of f"%:&,o%sI

g. T.e A99-,:a%& ,s de facto #e9+,)e# of a%@ $ea%,%gf"- 8o+D6 as .e :a%%o& :o%&a:& 9a+&,es6 .,+e s&aff6 &+a)e- a%# s9e%# $o%e@I

.. I% a%@ e)e%&6 &.e :o%&es&e# $eas"+es 8e+e #,s9+o9o+&,o%a&e &o a:.,e)e &.e 9"+9ose &.e@ 9"+9o+&e#-@ so"g.& &o a:.,e)e6 &.a& ,s &o $a,%&a,% &.e status quoI

,. Co%seE"e%&-@6 &.e A99-,:a%& asDs &.e T+,*"%a- &o:

,. 4,%# &.a& &.e :o%&es&e# eo+a%#a a+e +e&a-,a&o+@ a%# "%-a8f"-I a%#

,,. A8a+# .,$:o$9e%sa&,o% ,% &.e a$o"%& of s,B $o%&.s7 %e& *ase sa-a+@.

20. T.e Res9o%#e%&7s 9+,%:,9a- :o%&e%&,o%s a+e:

a. T.e :o%&es&e# #e:,s,o%s a+e a 9+o9e+ eBe+:,se of $a%age+,a- #,s:+e&,o% g,)e% &.a& &.e A99-,:a%& :o%s,s&e%&-@ fa,-e# &o fo--o8 ,%s&+":&,o%s f+o$ se%,o+

2A. If ,& ,s #e&e+$,%e# &.a& &.e :o%&es&e# #e:,s,o%s 8e+e ,%#ee# a#$,%,s&+a&,)e $eas"+es &aDe% ,%&.e eBe+:,se of $a%age+,a-#,s:+e

#e)e-o9$e%& 9a+&%e+s &o $a,%&a,% 9o-,&,:a- a%# f,%a%:,a- s"99o+& &o G 2 OPA Se:+e&a+,a&I +e9+ese%&,%g UN15a*,&a& a%# G 2 OPA ,% ,%&e+%a&,o%a-6 +eg,o%a- a%# %a&,o%a- fo+a a%# 8,&. %a&,o%a-6 +eg,o%a- a%# -o:a- go)e+%$e%&a- *o#,esI a%# :o%&+,*"&,%g &o &.e ,$9-e$e%&a&,o% of UN15a*,&a& 8o+D 9+og+a$ $e ,% U+*a% Bas,: Se+),:es.

2H. 4+o$ 22 /a+:. 2012 6 &.e A99-,:a%& 8o+De# "%#e+ &.e #,+e:&s"9e+),s,o% of /+. Be+& D,9.oo+%6 Se%,o+ A#),se+ &o &.e EBe:"&,)e D,+e:&o+6 UN15a*,&a&.

30. B@ eo+a%#a #a&e# 1(De:e$*e+ 201A6 &.e EBe:"&,)e D,+e:&o+6 UN15a*,&a&6 #e-ega&e# a"&.o+,&@ &o &.e A99-,:a%& &o +e:+",& :o%s"-&a%&s a%# ,%#,),#"a- :o%&+a:&o+s6 &o s,g% &e$9-a&e ag+ee$e%&s a%# -ega- ,%s&+"$e%&s a%# &o "%#e+&aDe 9+o:"+e$e%& ;=#e-ega&,o%s of a"&.o+,&@><.

31. O% 22 /a@ 201 6 fo--o8,%g /+. D,9.oo+%7s +e&,+e$e%&6 G 2 OPA 8as +e-o:a&e# ,% &.e U+*a% Bas,: Se+),:es B+a%:. as 9a+& of S"*19+og+a$ $e A of &.e S&+a&eg,: P-a% 201A1201H a%# &.e A99-,:a%& +e9o+&e# &o &.e S"*19+og+a$ $e Coo+#,%a&o+6 /+. A%#+e DC,D"s.

32. B@ &.e :o%&es&e# #e:,s,o%s6 &.e #e-ega&,o%s of a"&.o+,&@ $e%&,o%e# ,% 9a+a. 30 8e+e 8,&.#+a8% fo+ a% ,%#ef,%,&e 9e+,o# a%# &.e A99-,:a%& 8as a-so ,%s&+":&e# %o& &o e%gage 8,&. e*e+ s&a&es6 UN age%:,es6 &.e S&ee+,%g Co$$,&&ee a%# &.e 8,#e+ e*e+s.,9 of G 2 OPA6 $e#,a6 o&.e+ go)e+%$e%&s6 o+ o&.e+ 9a+&%e+s o% a%@ &o9,:8,&.o"&&.e 9+,o+ a99+o)a- of &.e D,+e:&o+6 P+og+a$ $e D,),s,o%.

33.

3A. I& a-so a99ea+s &.a& &.e A99-,:a%& eBe+:,se# .,s f"%:&,o%s of 5ea# of G 2 OPA Se:+e&a+,a& a%# P+og+a$ $e / a%age+ s,%:e 200' a%# &.a& .e +e:e,)e# a #e-ega&,o%

e s"?e:&&o 9+,o+ a99+o)a-6 .a#&.e effe:& of s,g%,f,:a%&-@ :"+&a,-,%g&.e A99-,:a%&7s $a+g,% of $a%oe")+e a%# a"&.o+,&@.

3'. T.a& sa,#6 ,& :a%%o& +easo%a*-@ *e :o%:-"#e# &.a& &.e A99-,:a%& 8as effe:&,)e-@ #e9+,)e# of a s,g%,f,:a%& 9a+& of .,s f"%:&,o%s. 5e :o"-# s&,-- 9e+fo+$ &.e$6 *"& .e 8as s"*?e:& &o a $":. &,g.&e+ -e)e- of s:+"&,%@ f+o$.,s s"9e+),so+s. A::o+#,%g-@6 &.e T+,*"%a- ,s of &.e),e8 &.a& &.e :o%&es&e# #e:,s,o%s a+e 9+o9e+-@ :.a+a:&e+,Ce# as a#$,%,s&+a&,)e $eas"+es &aDe% ,% &.e eBe+:,se of $a%age+,a-#,s:+e&,o%.

Did the contested decisions constitute a lawful exercise of managerial discretion?

3H. T.e e),#e%:e s.o8s &.a& &.e A99-,:a%& 8as ,%)o-)e# ,% a %"$*e+ of s,g%,f,:a%& a:&,o%s :o%:e+%,%g &.e s&+":&"+e a%# &.e f"&"+e of G2OPA 8,&.o"& :o%s"-&a&,o% 8,&. .,s $a%age$e%&.

A0. UN15a*,&a& .a# +easo%a*-e g+o"%#s &o *e-,e)e &.a& *e&8ee% No)e$*e+ a%# De:e$*e+ 201(6&.e A99-,:a%& % a+

AH. T.e A99-,:a%& #oes %o& #e%@ .a),%g &aDe%&.e a:&,o%s&.a&-e#&o&.e :o%&es&e# #e:,s,o%s. 2,&.o"& a#$,&&,%g &.e$6 &.e A99-,:a%& 9+o),#e# #,ffe+e%& a%#