UNITED NATIONS DISPUTE TRIBUNAL	Case No.:	UNDT/GVA/2016/0 !
	"#\$g%e&' No.:	UNDT/2017/01(
	Da'e:	7) a*+, 2017
	O*-g-&a.:	E&gs,

Before: "#\$ge Te*esa B*a/o

Registry: Ge&e/a

Registrar: Re&0). Va*gas

10

/.

SECRETAR 23GENERAL O4 T1E UNITED NATIONS

JUDGMENT

Counsel for Applicant: Se.f3*e5*ese&'e\$

Introduction

1. !" an #n\$om%lete a%%l#\$at#on #led on ' (\$to)e* 2016+ \$om%leted on

```
9. (n 8 Ju&" 201:+ s, e 6*ote anot, e* ema#k to 89+ UN5CCC+ *e@uest#ng inter
alia #n o*mat#on a)out 6, et, e* , e* *e%at*#at#on g*ant , ad )een *em#tted and+ # so+
d95 - 3.66653(n) - (n) - 0.9602210.873566 (ddd -
```

1:. ! " ema#& dated 30 - a" 2016 to t, e - anagement A2a&uat#on Un#t .3 - AU40+ t, e A%%&#\$ant *e@uested management e2a&uat#on o 3t, e &ong o2e*due %a"ment Bo , e*C *e%at*#at#on g*ant4.

16. 50kk06#ng \$kea*an\$e *om UN5CCC+ t,e 5#nan\$#ak 9esou*\$es - anagement 1e*2#\$e+ UN (G+ *ekeased t,e %a"ment o t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant 6#t, a %a"ment date o 31 - a" 2016. As %e* t,e do\$uments on #ke+ t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant amount ,ekd #n t*ust 6as U1D:+99'.07. >t 6as 6#*ed+ as %e* t,e A%%k#\$ant?s #nst*u\$t#ons+ to ,e* - ; 9 a\$\$ount+ and t,e \$on2e*s#on *om U1D to - ; 9 6as made us#ng t,e %*e2a#k#ng Un#ted Nat#ons (%e*at#onak 9ates o A=\$,ange .UN(9A0 o - a" 2016+ namek" U1D1 E - ; 93.897+ *esukt#ng #n t,e \$*ed#t#ng o - ; 923+3:8.89 to t,e A%%k#\$ant.

17. ! " &ette* dated 6 June 2016+ t,e - AU a\$7no6&edged *e\$e#%t o t,e A%%&#\$ant?s *e@uest o* management e2a&uat#on.

18. !" ema#k o 8 June 2016+ a 8 uman 9 esou*\$es (#\$e*+ 8 9+ UN5CCC+ sent to t, e A%%k#\$ant an 3U - (JA \$k#% *ega*d#ng t, e d#s)u*sement o t, e *e%at*#at#on g*ant4. >t s, o 6 ed t, at U1D:+99'.07, ad)een \$kea*ed o* %a"ment e e\$t#2e 31 - a" 2016. !" ema#k o t, e same da"+ t, e A%%k#\$ant #n o*med UN5CCC t, at t, e mone", ad not "et *ea\$, ed, e* a\$\$ount and t, at+)ased on t, e #n o*mat#on s, e, ad *e\$e#2ed+ s, e 6 as o t, e 2#e6 t, at t, e (*gan#<at#on , ad unde*%a#d, e* U1D268.29.

19. ! " ema#k o 9 June 2016+ a 8 uman 9 esou*\$es Ass#stant+ 8 9+ UN5CCC+ *e%k#ed to t,e A%%k#\$ant t,at s,e ,ad 3\$onta\$ted t*easu*" aga#n o* u*t,e* #n o*mat#on4.

20. ! " ema#k o 10 June 2016+ t, e A%%k#\$ant *e#te*ated t, at s, e, ad not *e\$e#2ed an" mon#es #n, e* a\$\$ount. (n t, e same da"+ a 8 uman 9 esou*\$es Ass#stant+ UN5CCC+ *e%k#ed to t, e A%%k#\$ant t, at UN5CC 6 as 3st#kk a 6 a#t#ng eed)a\$7 *om t*easu*"4.

21. ! " ema#& o 1' June 2016 to t, e A%%&#\$ant+ t, e - AU ad2#sed , e* t, at 3t, e Adm#n#st*at#on %*esented a %a"s&#% 6, e*e)" t, e *e%at*#at#on g*ant B, ad)eenC

t*ans e**ed to B, e*C a\$\$ount4+ and as7ed , e* to \$on #*m # s,e , ad *e\$e#2ed t,e %a"ment #n @uest#on. !" ema#o 1: June 2016+ t,e A%%#\$ant inter alia ad2#sed t,e - AU t, at at,oug, s,e , ad not *e\$e#2ed an" %a"s# +s,e , ad)een unde*% a#d U1D268 o* , e* *e%at*#at#on g*ant and t, at s,e 6#s, ed to 3add t, #s unde*%a"ment to B, e*C \$a#m aga#nst UN5CCC4.

22. ! " ema#å dated 21 June 2016+ a 8 uman 9 esou*\$es (#\$e*+ 8 9+ UN5CCC+ #n@u#*ed 6#t, t,e A%%å#\$ant # s,e ,ad *e\$e#2ed t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant.

23. ! " &ette* dated 1 ' Ju&" 2016+ t,e - AU #n o*med t,e A%%&#\$ant t,at #t 6ou&d %*o\$eed to \$&ose ,e* #&e. >n su%%o*t o t,#s+ t,e - AU ad2#sed t,e A%%&#\$ant+ inter alia+ t,at %a"ment o ,e* *e%at*#at#on g*ant+ amount#ng to U1D:+99'.07+ ,ad)een e=e\$uted on 31 - a" 2016 and t,at s,e ,ad \$on #*med *e\$e#%t o t,e e@u#2a&ent

A%%&#ant+ #.e.+ 21 da"s+ an on &ead to os &ude t, at t, e %a"ment 6 as made #n June 2016 and t, at+ t, us+ t, e ., #g, e*0 UN (9A *ate o* t, at mont, s, ould , a2e)een a%%&#edH

\$. 1,e &ost t,e o%%o*tun#t" to 3add to B,e*C \$u**ent&",e&d *#s7 *ee
#n2estment a\$\$ount 6#t, a "#e&d o a%%*o=#mate&" 6.: I %e* annum4H

d. > %a"ment ,ad)een made #n De\$em)e* 201:+ s,e 6ou&d ,a2e)ene #tted *om a ,#g,e* UN (9A .U1D1 E - ; 9 '+290H

e.

. T,e A%%&#\$ant #s a&so not ent#t&ed to mo*a& damages)e\$ause s,e d#d not su)m#t an" e2#den\$e #n su%%o*t o #t+ as *e@u#*ed)" a*t. 10.:.)0 o t,e UNDT 1tatute. 5u*t,e*mo*e+ 3a de&a" \$annot)e \$ons#de*ed as a undamenta&)*ea\$, o t,e A%%&#\$ant?s *#g,ts4+ and s,e d#d not 3\$&a#m to)e #n #nan\$#a& d#st*ess L o* to ,a2e su e*ed s%e\$# #\$ mo*a& damages due to t,e de&a"4.

Consideration

27. T, e T*#) una& #*st , as to de\$#de u%on some %*e&#m#na*" %*o\$edu*a& matte*s.

Ex parte documents filed by the Applicant

28. T, e T*#)una& de\$#des t, at t, e ex parte do\$uments #ked)" t, e A%%&#\$ant on
17 5e)*ua*" 2017 s,a& *ema#n ex parte

Legal framework

32. 1ta *u&e 3.19.a0 .9e%at*#at#on g*ant0 %*o2#des t,atF

T,e %u*%ose o t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant %*o2#ded)" sta *egu&at#on 9.' #s to a\$#k#tate t,e *e&o\$at#on o e=%at*#ate sta mem)e*s to a \$ount*" ot,e* t,an t,e \$ount*" o t,e &ast dut" stat#on+ %*o2#ded t,at t,e" meet t,e \$ond#t#ons \$onta#ned #n anne= >V to t,e 1ta 9egu&at#ons and #n t,#s *u&e.

33. 1ta 9egu&at#on 9. ' st#%u&ates t, atF

T, e 1e*eta*''/Gene*a& s, a&& esta)&#s, a s\$, eme o* t, e %a''ment o *e%at*#at#on g*ants #n a\$\$o*dan\$e 6#t, t, e ma=#mum *ates and unde* t, e \$ond#t#ons s%e\$# #ed #n anne= >V o t, ese 9egu&at#ons.

3'. T, e a)o2e/ment#oned anne= >V .9e%at*#at#on g*ant0 states t, e ot o6#ngF

>n %*#n\$#%&e+ t,e *e%at*#at#on g*ant s,a&)e %a"a)&e to sta mem)e*s 6,o ,a2e \$om%&eted at &east #2e "ea*s o @ua&# "#ng

su)m#tted , e* %*oo o *e&o\$at#on to t , e date o 3%

Com%ensat#on o* mate*#a& damages

\$annot)e \$onst*ued as a&&#ng 6#t, #n t, e *es%ons#)#&#t" o t, e Un#ted Nat#ons+ and \$annot #m%a\$t on t, e a%%&#\$a)&e UN(9A. 5u*t, e*mo*e+ an" damage o t, e A%%&#\$ant , as to)e assessed)" \$om%a*#ng t, e amount o - ; 9 s, e 6ou&d , a2e *e\$e#2ed #n \$ase o 3t#me&" %a"ment4 as des\$*#)ed a)o2e+ as o%%osed to t, e amount a\$tua&&" *e\$e#2ed+)" a%%&"#ng t, e UN(9A at t, e date o t, e %a"ment

:3. T,e T*#)una& #s a6a*e o #ts Ju*#s%*uden\$e #n t,e \$ase o Castelli UNDT/2010/011 .see %a*a. 130+ 6#t, *es%e\$t to t,e #nte*est *ate to)e %a#d as %a*t o t,e a6a*d o \$om%ensat#on unde* a*t. 10.:+ name&" t,atF

BaCt akk e2ents+ t,e onk" 6a" #n 6,#\$, t,e a%%k#\$ant \$an)e %ka\$ed #n t,e same %os#t#on #n 6,#\$, ,e 6oukd ,a2e)een ,ad t,e (*gan#<at#on %a#d t,e de)t t,at #t o6ed ,#m #s)" a6a*d#ng ,#m #nte*est s#n\$e t,e date u%on 6,#\$, %a"ment 6as due at a *ate t,at #s *e ke\$t#2e o t,e amount t,at \$oukd ,a2e)een ea*ned ,ad #t)een #n2ested.

:'. 5u*t,e*mo*e+ t,e T*#)una& *e\$akks t,at #n Warren 2010/UNAT/0:9+ t,e

62.

Ante*ed #n t,e 9eg#ste* on t,#s 7^{t,} da" o - a*\$, 2017 .)igned0 9en0 - . Va*gas - .+ 9eg#st*a*+ Gene2a