PROVISION FOR POST PROJECT EVALUATIONS FOR THE UNITED NATIONS DEMOCRACY FUND
Contract NO.PD:C0110/10

UDF-PER-09-337 - %XLOGLQJ D ³'LJLWDO 'HPRFUDF\ 1HWZRUN´ ''

Date: 2 January 2014

Acknowledgments
The evaluation team would like to thank Ana Maria ROMERO-LOZADA and Antonieta MANRIQUE, as well as all the members of the CGDD team who devoted their time and energy to organizing this mission. Their good will and professionalism contributed to its success.

The evaluators would also like to thank all members and beneficiaries of the DDN project who participated in this evaluation process and agreed to share their thoughts and experiences.

Disclaimer
The evaluators are solely responsible for the content of this publication, which in no case can be considered to reflect the views of UNDEF, Transtec, or any other institutions and/or individuals mentioned in the report.

Authors
This report was written by Luisa María AGUILAR and Susana GUEVARA. Landis MacKellar (Evaluation Team Leader and Transtec Quality Manager) provided methodological and editorial input, as well as quality assu0.824 5( )-134(m)-3(e)13(m)7(be)3(are)-rn(w)1560.62 Tm 005su

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 1
II. INTRODUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT 4
III. PROJECT STRATEGY 7
IV. EVALUATION FINDINGS 9
V. CONCLUSIONS 17
VI. RECOMMENDATIONS 19
ANNEXES 21
ANNEX 1: EVALUATION QUESTIONS: 21

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

(i) Project Data

This report presents the findings from the evaluation of the Building a Digital Democracy Network (RDD) project, implemented by the Global Center for Development and Democracy (CGDD) in collaboration with the Stanford University Program on Liberation Technology and the Stanford University School of Education.[1] The project was executed from April 1, 2011 to March 31, 2013. UNDEF provided a grant of US$250,000, $25,000 of which was retained for monitoring and evaluation purposes.

The project's goal is to hear the voice of poor and marginalized populations in the political process, create new educational media and enhance economic development through the creation of collaborative business networks. By using telecommunications technology, the project will provide poor and marginalized populations with software tools, such as: on-line courses for citizens, real-time focus groups and polls, anti-corruption channels ² e.g., chat rooms and blogs for democratic participation and access to public policy formulation to establish open and transparent governance. With the implementation of the Digital Democracy Network, local actors will bolster the F L W L ¡apac¶ for civic engagement and defend their right to defense mechanisms and access to public information.

Part of the post-project evaluations financed by the United Nations Democracy Fund 8 1 ' ( ) W K H H Y D O X D W L R Q P L V V L R Q ¶ V R E- Mept F Wnal Yis of V W R X UNDEF-

II. INTRODUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT

(i) The project and evaluation objectives

This report presents the findings from the evaluation of the Building a Digital Democracy Network (DDN) project implemented by the Global Center for Development and Democracy (CGDD). The Stanford University

The Executive Director and staff of the CGDD
Project staff: executive coordinator; administrative and logistics assistant; consultants in the areas of training, institutional capacity building, and assessment; computer connectivity; and the systematization of experiences
Universidad Nacional Tecnológica del Sur (UNTECS) and its Social Outreach and Extension Office, located in Villa El Salvador
The municipal government of Villa Maria del Triunfo and its Human Development and Anti-Poverty Office
A representative of the DDN Consortium of social grassroots organizations
A representative number (sample) of beneficiaries of the S U R M field activities in the two intervention districts (leaders and members of neighborhood and women ¶ V organizations and local organizations and institutions)

Annex 3 contains the complete list of persons interviewed.

(iii) Development c ontext

An important aspect of the Peruvian context is the governance situation in terms of accountability, control of corruption, and citizen participation. Although the country has legal instruments governing transparency and accountability, such as the Transparency and Access to Public Information Act, it still has a way to go. The supervision report of the 2 P E X G V P D Q ¶ V on the transparency portals of public institutions indicates that the ministries are, on average, 74% in compliance; the regional governments, 65%; and the provincial municipal governments in department capitals, 49%. Moreover, 76.9% of the population believes that corruption among public officials is rampant and 28.5% claim to have been the victim of corruption.[3]

Citizen participation is guaranteed in the Political Constitution and other legal instruments. It was buttressed by the decentralization process, under which citizen participation has been a public policy established by law since 2002. One of the most well-known mechanisms for citizen participation is preparation of the participatory budgets of the municipal and regional governments. As for trust, which is fundamental to democracy, studies[4] in Peru reveal that the most trusted insti4(t)6(r)m [(28)3(.)-4(5%)] TJ ET842.7d117.17 Tm [( )] TJ(os)13(t)-4(404 595.47TJ

Villa El Salvador was its neighborhood organization, which is still active. In 1973, an assembly of some 3,000 neighborhood delegates voted to become a self-managed community, forming CUAVES (Self-managed Urban Community of Villa El Salvador), which was recognized as a district in 1983.[6] Community participation remains important to this day and over the years has been key to local development. In 1999, this district was where the participatory budget methodology was first employed in Peru, later becoming mandatory across the nation.

In 2013 the population of Villa El Salvador reached 445,189 (5.2% of the total population of Lima province).[7] Since 1984 the district has had 10 mayors elected by popular vote. The last one, elected for the 2011-2014 term, was removed from office early in his tenure because he had a record of tax fraud. The current mayor took office in December 2011.

Villa María del Triunfo is an old district whose origins lie in the 1949 land invasions by poor migrants, although some human settlements were already present as early as 1943. In 1961, the law creating the district was passed.[8] In 2013, the district had a population of 448,545 (5.2% of the provincial total).[9] It has had 18 mayors since its creation, the current incumbent being its first female mayor.

The two districts have social grassroots organizations that have arisen in response to the economic crisis and poverty. These organizations can be divided into three generations:[10] the first emerged in the 1960 ¶ Vand fought for the installation of sewerage systems or food programs (community soup kitchens); the second made its appearance in the 1990s as a result of the economic crisis and structural adjustment policies (P R W K ehubs, ¶soup kitchens, Vaso de Leche Program committees); the last and most recent generation is production-oriented, with an entrepreneurial vision. The three types of social grassroots organizations are present today and have different focuses. Many of them have problems renewing their ranks and filling seats on their boards of directors.

[6] Historical data obtained from http://www.munives.gob.pe/histor.php
[7] INEI. Población 2000-2015: http://www.inei.gob.pe/web/poblacion/
[8] Data obtained from http://munivmt.gob.pe/portal/distritos/
[9] INEI. Población 2000-2015: http://www.inei.gob.pe/web/poblacion/
[10]

III. PROJECT STRATEGY

(i) Project a ppro ach and strategy

The strategy prioritized in project implementation is in alignment with the mission of the

(ii) Logical framework

7 K H W D E O H E H O R Z V X P P D U L Z H V W K H L Q W H U Y H Q W L R Q O R J L F I U D P H Z R U N L Q W K U H H F R O X P Q V ² L Q S X W V R X W S X W V D Q G R X W F R P H V ² D Q G V K R Z V W K H U H O D W L R Q V K L S E H W Z H H Q W K H V H W K U H H H O H P H Q W V ² W K U H H R I Z K L F K Z H U H Q R W D F K L H Y H G ² Z L W K V R P H D V S H F W V R I W K H R W K H U I L Y H D O V R D G G U H V V H G ² W K H S U R M H F W K H O S V L P S U R J U H V V L Q D F K L H Y L Q J W K H U H V X O W V ² E X W W K H U H O D W L R Q V K L S E H W Z H H Q W K H V W U D W H J \ W K H D F W L Y L W L H V D Q G W K H U H V X O W V D F K L H Y H G L V X Q F O H D U

f Baseline study in two pilot sites: VES and VMT *f* Agreements with UNTECS (VES) and the VMT district government	R 1 - Local players improve their advocacy skills and access to public information with DDN	x The DDN is put on the agenda of the two intervention districts	*f* Leaders of social grassroots organizations trained in the use of ICT and informed about the importance of exercising digital governance and democracy *f* The project helps bridge the generation and gender gap, helping women leaders gain a foothold

enabled low-income populations to learn about the benefits of participating in decisions affecting local governance and monitoring by citizens. The criteria and modalities for selecting the beneficiaries through the district grassroots organizations in VES and social grassroots organization

second phase, the CGDD decided to refocus the project strategy, giving priority to training the beneficiary groups.

For the implementation of the training program, the CGDD signed agreements with UNTECS in VES and the municipal government in VMT. The partner institutions covered some of the costs of the activities: In VMT, the municipal government covered the cost of the locale, electricity, Internet, certificate printing, and the reception at the conclusion of the project. In VES, UNTECS covered the cost of the locale, electricity, and Internet. The courses were taught by personnel hired by the project (one expert and one tutor per module). For digital literacy training in VES, professors from UNTECS and students in their final year at the university provided support. In VMT, the project had a group of volunteers from Universidad de San Ignacio de Loyola, whose commuting costs were covered by the project.

For management and monitoring, the coordination team held periodic meetings with the consultants, partner institutions, social leaders from the two districts, and course participants. It also made monitoring visits during the training sessions to provide detailed information on the implementation of each module.

One of the efficiency problems observed by the evaluators

governance on the agenda of the dialogue between local governments and civil society organizations in the two districts.

Many of the beneficiaries in VES were the heads of social grassroots organizations whose community activities had begun in the 1970s, when people began to settle in the district. The opportunity to learn how to use ICT was altogether new to them and changed their perspective; it even drew them closer to and improved communication with the younger generation, which is already digitally literate, and enabled them to learn about new topics and search for information about others. The women, who at first were afraid of damaging the computers, expressed satisfaction at having entered the world of social networking, which has opened new opportunities for them in their personal, family, and community life (from learning to turn on the computer to creating and using e-mail, opening a Facebook account, communicating with family and friends, and knowing with whom their children are linked and what networks they use). The project also helped build solidarity between women involved in small community initiatives, enabling them to learn about each another and share experiences. Several of the people interviewed considered the ability to get to know one another and discover who does what a very positive thing.

> The courses have allowed me to understand my children better, what they do in the cubicles [«] before, I wondered why they spent so much time there and I would yell at them about it. Now I sit there myself and understand what the computer does.
> Woman from a grassroots organization, VMT district

In VMT, the Villa María municipal government issued a Municipal Council Resolution for implementing the DDN. This has opened new channels of communication between the municipal government and the community on local governance issues. The mayor has noted how motivated citizens are, commenting that at Tuesday public meetings (which are transmitted via the Internet), residents discuss their problems, sending e-

the courses, exploring processes and mechanisms that could be developed to improve the situation. The project has had little impact at these levels. As stated earlier, from the interviews and visits conducted by the mission, it can be concluded that the beneficiary groups were more interested in the benefits offered by the new ICT than in the components necessary for the participatory exercise of democracy.

L

expressed an interest in expanding the project to other sectors of the municipality. Priority would be given to training youth who migrate to the district from the provinces in search of employment.

All this

> The Project Document that we received focused primarily on setting up computer centers. We wanted to emphasize training, but it was impossible to make many changes.
> A.M R. CGDD Director

V. CONCLUSIONS

The main conclusions and lessons learned observed by the evaluators can be summarized as follows:

(i) The project laid the foundations for tackling the issue of digital governance and democracy . In the two low-income districts of metropolitan Lima, Villa María del Triunfo and Villa El Salvador, the project raised awareness among the beneficiary groups about the importance of using ICT tools to support digital governance and democracy, while at the same time increasing their motivation. This issue has become part of the agenda for the dialogue between local government and social organizations in the two districts, although support for the implementation the governance and democracy process may be necessary.

(ii) It helped reduce the gender and generation gap. Women who prior to taking the courses had used ICT much less because of problems with digital access or lack of self-confidence or opportunities to develop their computer skills proved to be highly motivated and participated actively. Given the high degree of Z R P H Q¶V involvement in community participation initiatives such as the Casas de Enlace, this is a very positive outcome. The project also helped reduce the generation gap, since many leaders of the social organizations who received training were at least 45 years old and had considered it virtually impossible to master computer technology.

(iii) Local stakeholders pledged continuity . Although results in the two districts varied with the context, stakeholders managed to develop fairly organized mechanisms to guarantee the L Q L W L D W L Y H ¶V sustainability. In VMT, the project raised awareness among local authorities and got them involved, since the municipal government had assumed responsibility for ensuring follow-up, institutionalizing the activities and allocating the human resources needed for project implementation. In VES, the leaders of social grassroots organizations created a Consortium, which is the entity charged with providing continuity for the activities. Although the overriding interest is mor.h t is context,g(w)15(o)-4( )-188(i)5Tm

presenting the information more didactically and graphically to make it more user-friendly. Had this been done at the outset, there might have been greater use of the Platform as a valuable tool for the exercise of

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

The evaluation team proposes some guidelines for maximizing the impact and sustainability RI WKH SURMHFW¶V OXQJV Notwithstanding the problems observed in the design phase, the project achieved significant results. The challenge going forward is to capitalize on the lessons learned to strengthen citizen governance and the exercise of democracy, linking the digital component more closely with WKH EHQHILFLDULHV¶ appropriation of the rights approach. To this end, the mission recommends:

i. Clearly and explicitly integrating the rights approach and exercise of democracy into the intervention strategy and methodology. The conceptual and methodological approach could be strengthened, better articulating the specific content and SUDFWLFHV VXFK DV ZRPHQ¶V SDUWLFLSDWLRQ DFFHVV W public information, the benefits of the Transparency and Access to Public Information Act, local participation mechanisms, democracy in organizations, and use of the digital tool) with the rights approach in a very didactic manner and analyzing case studies. More m

Book: Systematization of the experience of the DDN Project

in the associative environment and have experience in teaching and didactically presenting these issues. It would be a good idea for the CGDD to work in synergy with other projects and initiatives focusing on democracy, rights, local governance, access to information, and freedom of expression, using digital platforms. A similar project developed by the University of Lima is working with youth groups in VES; moreover, the Neighborhood Participation Office of the VMT municipal government has courses on municipal management for leaders of social grassroots organizations (See Conclusion iv).

iv. Develop tools and mechanisms for monitoring and technical assistance . * L Y H Q W K H interest in making this activity a pilot intervention, a strategy must be designed to

ANNEXES

ANNEX 1: EVALUATION QUESTIONS:

DAC criterion	Evaluation Question

ANNEX 3: PERSONS INTERVIEWED

Saturday, May 25, 2013	
Arrival of international expert	
Sunday, May 26, 2013	
Meeting of evaluation team	Luisa María Aguilar, International Expert Susana Guevara, National Expert.
Monday, May 27, 2013	
Interview with DDN Project Coordinating Committee	
Ana María Romero-Lozada	Director, Global Center for Development and Democracy in Peru
Antonieta Manrique	DDN Project Coordinator
Juan Carlos Guerrero	DDN Project Professional
Antonieta Manrique	Executive Coordinator, DDN Project
Carlos Espinoza	Executive Coordinator, DDN Project 2011
Nancy Tello	Administrative assistant

ANNEX 4: ACRONYMS

CCL	Consejo de Coordinación Local
CGDD	Global Center for Development and Democracy
CUAVES	Comité Urbano Autogestionario del VES
DDN	Digital Democracy Network
ICT	Information and Communication Technologies
UNDEF	United Nations Democracy Fund
UNTECS	Universidad Nacional Tecnológica del Sur
VES	Villa El Salvador
VMT	Villa María del Triunfo